

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS**

WILLIAM BISCAN, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

SHIELDS HEALTH CARE GROUP, INC.,

Defendant.

**CIVIL ACTION NO.: 1:22-cv-10901-PBS**

LISA SMITH individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

SHIELDS HEALTH CARE GROUP, INC.,

Defendant.

**CIVIL ACTION NO.: 4:22-cv-10932-DHH**

JAMES BUECHLER, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

SHIELDS HEALTH CARE GROUP, INC.,

Defendant.

**CIVIL ACTION NO.: 1:22-cv-10988-PBS**

ELSIE DIAZ, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

SHIELDS HEALTH CARE GROUP, INC.,

Defendant.

**CIVIL ACTION NO.: 1:22-cv-11002-AK**

<p>JONATHAN ROACH, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,</p> <p>Plaintiff,</p> <p>v.</p> <p>SHIELDS HEALTH CARE GROUP, INC.,</p> <p>Defendant.</p>	<p><b>CIVIL ACTION NO.: 1:22-cv-11035-PBS</b></p>
<p>TENNIE KOMAR, on behalf of herself and all others similarly situated,</p> <p>Plaintiff,</p> <p>v.</p> <p>SHIELDS HEALTH CARE GROUP, INC.,</p> <p>Defendant.</p>	<p><b>CIVIL ACTION NO.: 1:22-CV-11109-JCB</b></p>
<p>DEBRA MONETTE, on behalf of herself and all others similarly situated,</p> <p>Plaintiff,</p> <p>v.</p> <p>SHIELDS HEALTH CARE GROUP, INC.,</p> <p>Defendant.</p>	<p><b>CIVIL ACTION NO.: 1:22-cv-11131-PBS</b></p>

**MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN SUPPORT OF ASSENTED-TO MOTION FOR  
CONSOLIDATION OF ACTIONS AND SETTING SCHEDULE FOR APPLICATIONS  
FOR APPOINTMENT OF INTERIM CLASS COUNSEL**

Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 42(a) and Local Rule 40.1(j), Plaintiffs in the above-captioned matters (collectively “Plaintiffs”), by and through counsel, respectfully move this Court for an Order: (1) consolidating the above-captioned actions; and (2) setting a schedule for the

submission of applications for appointment of interim class counsel in these related actions.

Defendant has assented to the relief sought in this motion.

There are seven (7) related proposed class actions pending in the District of Massachusetts: *Biscan v. Shields Health Care Group, Inc.*, Case No. 1:22-CV-10901 (“*Biscan*”); *Smith v. Shields Health Care Group, Inc.*, Case No. 1:22-CV-10932 (“*Smith*”); *Buechler v. Shields Health Care Group, Inc.*, Case No. 1:22-CV-10988 (“*Buechler*”); *Diaz v. Shields Health Care Group, Inc.*, Case No. 1:22-CV-11002 (“*Diaz*”); *Roach v. Shields Health Care Group, Inc.*, Case No. 1:22-CV-11035 (“*Roach*”); *Komar v. Shields Health Care Group, Inc.*, Case No. 1:22-CV-11109 (“*Komar*”); and *Monette v. Shields Health Care Group, Inc.*, Case No. 1:22-CV-11131 (“*Monette*”)(collectively, the “Related Cases”).

Plaintiffs in the Related Cases (“Plaintiffs”) allege that Defendant Shields Health Care Group, Inc. (“Shields”) failed to secure sensitive information stored on its file servers and thus compromised millions of people’s personal information (the “Data Breach”).

Plaintiffs and Shields, by and through their respective counsel (together, the “parties”), have conferred and agree that consolidation is appropriate under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 42(a) because the Related Cases involve common questions of law or fact. Specifically, the cases name a common defendant, arise from the same Data Breach, and assert similar claims. Further, Plaintiffs agree that a streamlined process for the appointment of interim class counsel under Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(g)(3) will be beneficial to the effective prosecution of the class claims.

## ARGUMENT

### **I. THE ACTIONS SHOULD BE CONSOLIDATED FOR ALL PURPOSES**

Consolidation is appropriate when the actions before the court involve common questions of law or fact. *See Fed. R. Civ. P. 42(a); see also Seguro De Servicio De Salud De Puerto Rico v. McAuto Sys. Grp., Inc.*, 878 F.2d 5, 8 (1st Cir.1989) (“The threshold issue” in determining whether to consolidate cases under Rule 42(a) “is whether the two proceedings involve a common party and common issues of fact or law.”).

Here, Plaintiffs and Shields agree that consolidation is appropriate under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 42(a) because the Related Cases involve common questions of law or fact. Specifically, the cases name a common defendant, arise from the same Data Breach, and assert similar claims. Consolidation is therefore appropriate.

### **II. THE COURT SHOULD ENTER THE PROPOSED SCHEDULE TO CONSIDER APPLICATIONS FOR APPOINTMENT OF INTERIM CLASS COUNSEL**

Rule 23(g)(3) authorizes a court to “designate interim counsel to act on behalf of a putative class before determining whether to certify the action as a class action.” “Although not required, appointment of interim class counsel may help ‘clarif[y] responsibility for protecting the interests of the class during precertification activities, such as making and responding to motions, conducting any necessary discovery, moving for class certification, and negotiating settlement.’” *See Arkansas Teacher Ret. Sys. v. State Street Corp.*, No. 11-10230-MLW, 2012 WL 13118446, at \*1 (D. Mass. Jan. 12, 2012) (alterations in original); *see also* Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(g)(3), 2003 Advisory Committed Notes for Rule 23(g).

Here, Plaintiffs agree that a streamlined process for the appointment of interim class counsel under Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(g)(3) will be beneficial to the effective prosecution of the class

claims. The parties have met and conferred and propose, subject to Court approval, that this action should proceed on the following schedule:

- Any counsel in the Related Actions may file an individual or joint application for consideration as interim class counsel within five (5) business days after entry of an order consolidating the Related Actions;
- Plaintiffs will file a Consolidated Complaint (“Complaint”) no later than forty-five (45) days following entry of an Order appointing interim class counsel;
- Defendant will Answer or otherwise respond to Plaintiffs’ Complaint no later than thirty (30) days following filing of the Complaint; and
- Defendant shall have no obligation to Answer or otherwise respond to the current complaints in the Related Action prior to the consolidated Complaint being filed.

### **CONCLUSION**

For the foregoing reasons, Plaintiffs request that this Court enter the proposed order: consolidating the Actions and setting a schedule for applications for the appointment of interim class counsel.

Dated: July 19, 2022

Respectfully submitted,

**BERMAN TABACCO**

*/s/ Patrick T. Egan*

Patrick T. Egan (BBO #637477)

Nathaniel L. Orenstein (BBO #664513)

One Liberty Square

Boston, MA 02109

Telephone: (617) 542-8300

[pegan@bermantabacco.com](mailto:pegan@bermantabacco.com)

[norenstein@bermantabacco.com](mailto:norenstein@bermantabacco.com)

*Attorneys For Plaintiffs Buechler and Roach*

**SWEENEY MERRIGAN LAW, LLP**

/s/ J. Tucker Merrigan

J. Tucker Merrigan (BBO# 681627)  
Peter M. Merrigan (BBO# 673272)  
268 Summer Street, LL  
Boston, MA 02210  
Telephone: (617) 391-9001  
Fax: (617) 357-9001  
tucker@sweeneymerrigan.com  
peter@sweeneymerrigan.com

**FINKELSTEIN, BLANKINSHIP,  
FREI-PEARSON & GARBER, LLP**

Todd. S. Garber (*pro hac vice* forthcoming)  
Andrew White (*pro hac vice* forthcoming)  
One North Broadway, Suite 900  
White Plains, New York 10601  
Telephone: (914) 298-3281  
Fax: (914) 824-1561  
tgarber@fbfglaw.com  
awhite@fbfglaw.com

**KELLER POSTMAN LLC**

Seth A. Meyer (*pro hac vice* forthcoming)  
Alex J. Dravillas *pro hac vice* forthcoming  
150 N. Riverside Plaza, Suite 4100  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Telephone: (312) 741-5220  
sam@kellerpostman.com  
ajd@kellerpostman.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Biscan*

**McDONOUGH COHEN & MASELEK, LLP**

/s/ Robert J. Maselek, Jr.

Robert J. Maselek, Jr. (BBO # 564690)  
53 State Street, Suite 500  
Boston, MA 02109  
Direct: 617.742.6520 (Ext. 246)  
Fax: 617.742.1393  
rmaselek@mcmlawfirm.com

**WOLF HALDENSTEIN ADLER FREEMAN  
& HERZ LLC**

Carl V. Malmstrom  
111 W. Jackson Blvd., Suite 1700  
Chicago, Illinois 60604  
Telephone: (312) 984-0000  
Fax: (212) 686-0114  
[malmstrom@whafh.com](mailto:malmstrom@whafh.com)

Thomas H. Burt  
270 Madison Ave.  
New York, New York 10014  
Telephone: (212) 545-4669  
Fax: (212) 686-0114  
[burt@whafh.com](mailto:burt@whafh.com)

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Smith*

**GEORGE GESTEN MCDONALD, PLLC**

Lori G. Feldman (*pro hac vice* forthcoming)  
102 Half Moon Bay Drive  
Croton-on-Hudson, NY 10520  
Telephone: (917) 983-9321  
[lfeldman@4-justice.com](mailto:lfeldman@4-justice.com)  
[eservice@4-justice.com](mailto:eservice@4-justice.com)

David J. George (*pro hac vice* forthcoming)  
9897 Lake Worth Road, Suite 302  
Lake Worth, FL 33467  
Telephone: (561) 232-6002  
[dgeorge@4-justice.com](mailto:dgeorge@4-justice.com)  
[eservice@4-justice.com](mailto:eservice@4-justice.com)

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs Buechler and Roach*

**BARRACK, RODOS & BACINE**

Jeffrey W. Golan (*pro hac vice* forthcoming)  
Meghan J. Talbot (*pro hac vice* forthcoming)  
Two Commerce Square  
2001 Mark Street, Suite 3300  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Telephone: (215) 963-0600  
jgolan@barrack.com  
mtalbot@barrack.com

Stephen R. Basser  
Samuel M. Ward  
600 West Broadway, Suite 900  
San Diego, CA 92101  
Telephone: (619) 230-0800  
Fax: (619) 230-1874  
sbasser@barrack.com  
sward@barrack.com

**EMERSON FIRM, PLLC**

John G. Emerson (*pro hac vice* forthcoming)  
2500 Wilcrest Drive, Suite 300  
Houston, TX 77042  
Telephone: (800) 551-8649  
Fax: (501) 286-4659  
jemerson@emersonfirm.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Buechler*

**MILBERG COLEMAN BRYSON  
PHILLIPS GROSSMAN, PLLC**

/s/ Randi A. Kassan  
Randi A. Kassan  
100 Garden City Plaza  
Suite 500  
Garden City, NY 11530  
Telephone: (516) 741-5600  
Fax: (516) 741-0128  
rkassan@thesandersfirm.com

Gary M. Klinger  
227 W. Monroe Street  
Suite 2100  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Telephone: (866) 252-0878  
gklinger@milberg.com

**TURKE & STRAUSS LLP**  
Samuel J. Strauss  
Raina C. Borrelli  
613 Williamson Street, Suite 201  
Madison, WI 53703  
Telephone: (608) 237-1775  
Fax: (608) 509-4423  
raina@turkestrauss.com  
sam@turkestrauss.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Diaz*

**BLOCK & LEVITON LLP**

/s/ Jason M. Leviton  
Jason M. Leviton (BBO #678331)  
260 Franklin Street, Suite 1860  
Boston, MA 02110  
Telephone: (617) 398-5600  
jason@blockleviton.com

**LYNCH CARPENTER, LLP**

Gary F. Lynch  
Jamisen A. Etzel  
1133 Penn Ave., Fl. 5  
Telephone: (412) 322-9243  
Fax: (412) 231-0246  
gary@lcllp.com  
jamise@lcllp.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Komar*

**SCOTT+SCOTT ATTORNEYS AT LAW  
LLP**

/s/ Joseph P. Guglielmo  
Joseph P. Guglielmo (BBO #671410)  
Carey Alexander  
The Helmsley Building  
230 Park Avenue, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, NY 10169  
Telephone: (212) 223-6444  
Fax: (212) 233-6334  
jguglielmo@scott-scott.com  
calexander@scott-scott.com

Erin Green Comite  
156 S. Main Street  
P.O. Box 192  
Colchester, CT 06415  
Telephone: (860) 531-2632  
Fax: (860) 537-4432  
ecomite@scott-scott.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Monette*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that this document filed through the ECF System will be sent electronically to the registered participants as identified on the Notice of Electronic Filing.

Dated: July 19, 2022

/s/ Patrick T. Egan  
Patrick T. Egan